

U.S.-Russia Initiative to Prevent Nuclear Terrorism

Российско-Американская инициатива по предотвращению ядерного терроризма

March-May 2014 Newsletter Информационный бюллетень за март-май 2014 г.



ИСКРАН

NEWS:

IPNT Participants Urge U.S and Russia to Continue Cooperating on Nuclear Security and Counter-Terrorism In Spite of Ukraine Crisis

[Siegfried Hecker](#), director of Stanford University's Center for International Security and participant in the U.S.-Russia Initiative to Prevent Nuclear Terrorism (IPNT), warned that the Ukraine crisis should not interrupt U.S.-Russian nuclear security cooperation. "As the United States and the European Union take short-term measures to restrain Russia's actions in Ukraine, they should not sacrifice the hard-earned gains made to stabilize the nuclear threats that arose after the dissolution of the Soviet Union," Hecker wrote in an [op-ed](#) in the *Bulletin of the*



Atomic Scientists.

[Matthew Bunn](#), Professor of Practice at Harvard Kennedy School and IPNT participant, [noted](#) that U.S.-Russian nuclear security cooperation continued even during the Georgian-Russian war in 2008. Similarly, he argued, "the Ukraine crisis and the 'poisonous' atmosphere it has created should not be allowed to disrupt nuclear security cooperation." Although the security situation in Russia has improved greatly since the mid-1990s, the U.S. government needs to continue to "protect the large taxpayer investment" represented by those improvements and work to "fix the problems that still exist."



[Graham Allison](#), director of the Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs and member of IPNT, praised the participants of the Nuclear Security Summit in the Netherlands for staying [focused](#) on the threat of nuclear terrorism despite their differences over Ukraine. He also [observed](#) that perhaps the only good news about the Ukraine crisis is that today Ukraine is nuclear-weapons-material free.

[Pavel Zolotarev](#), deputy director of Russia's Institute for U.S. and Canadian Studies, is confident that bilateral cooperation between Moscow and Washington will continue in areas such as counter-terrorism. Zolotarev, whose institute participates in IPNT, commented that "There are more and more hotbeds of terrorist threats; instability in a multipolar world is a natural phenomenon. Of course, such a threat is more difficult to fight. So how do we fight it? This is exactly within the scope of cooperation between Russia and the U.S.: countering of international terrorism. Ultimately, the differences on the Ukrainian question will not impede further cooperation against such terrorism."



[Alexei Arbatov](#), director of the Center for International Security at Russia's Institute for World Economy and International Relations, urged Russia and the West to stop battling over Ukraine, as this could lead to the post-Soviet republic being "torn into pieces." Arbatov [said](#), "If we agree not to tear Ukraine apart, but... let it remain a common coherent state (of course, without Crimea)... that would maintain relations with both the West and Russia, then we will continue to cooperate," according to Arbatov.



U.S.-Russia Initiative to Prevent Nuclear Terrorism

Российско-Американская инициатива по предотвращению ядерного терроризма

March-May 2014 Newsletter Информационный бюллетень за март-май 2014 г.

Belfer Center's [Simon Saradzhyan](#) believes that the crisis in Ukraine could result in "neither a pro-Western nor pro-Russian Ukraine, but rather a divided, failed Ukraine." "A Ukraine in peace with itself and in harmonious relations with both East and West is in the interest of not only Ukrainians themselves, but also of their neighbors and friends," according to Saradzhyan.



Matthew Bunn Highlights Insider Threats at Nuclear Facilities

Insider threats are the most serious challenge confronting nuclear facilities today, based on a new [study](#) co-authored by Belfer Center's Matthew Bunn and Scott Sagan of Stanford University. The authors found that in every case of theft of nuclear materials where the circumstances of the theft were known, the perpetrators were either insiders or had help from insiders, according to [Stanford Report](#). Moreover, "given that the other cases involve bulk material stolen covertly without anyone being aware the material was missing, there is every reason to believe that they were perpetrated by insiders as well."

Russia and U.S. Declare Their Stocks of Civilian Plutonium

Russia has submitted its annual [declaration](#) about its holdings of civilian plutonium to the International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA). According to the declaration, as of the end of 2012 Russia had 50.7 tons of unirradiated, separated plutonium, 1.2 tons more than was declared in 2011, the IPFM blog [reported](#). The United States has also submitted its declaration of its civilian plutonium stock to the IAEA. As of December 31st, 2012, the United States had 44.4 tons of separated plutonium described as "held elsewhere," 4.6 tons in unirradiated MOX fuel, and less than 0.05 tons held in the fuel fabrication process, according to the [IPFM](#). At the end of 2011, these numbers were 44.7, 4.6, and 0.05 tons respectively.

U.S. and Russia Carry on With Some Nuclear Security Cooperation Projects

While the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE) and the National Nuclear Security Administration (NNSA) have launched a review of all Russian-related activities, they have not announced the suspension of nuclear security cooperation with Russia, according to the U.S. embassy in Moscow. In its April 10th [press release](#), the U.S. diplomatic mission noted, "Cooperation with Russia remains an essential element to the global effort to address the threat posed by nuclear terrorism, and therefore, support key interests of both the United States and the international community." However, Itar-Tass reported that according to Rosatom's assessment, the DOE did suspend several peaceful atomic cooperation projects, including technical meetings devoted to scientific issues. Russia's *Kommersant* daily reported in early April that the DOE also barred Russian scientists from its leading physics laboratories.

At the same time, Rosatom's CEO Sergei Kirienko said that U.S.-Russian cooperation on the repatriation of highly enriched fuel from research reactors built to Russian and U.S. designs continued as of late April.

Separately, NNSA deputy administrator Anne Harrington [told](#) GSN on April 9th that U.S.-Russian negotiations over how to implement a nuclear security agreement that Washington signed with Moscow last year had concluded and work had resumed. She did not specify, however, what project had been resumed under the 2013 accord, which was meant to replace the Cooperative Threat Reduction umbrella agreement.

This spring the U.S. government [announced](#) a temporary suspension of a number of projects under the U.S.-Russia Bilateral Presidential Commission over the crisis in Ukraine without

U.S.-Russia Initiative to Prevent Nuclear Terrorism

Российско-Американская инициатива по предотвращению ядерного терроризма

March-May 2014 Newsletter Информационный бюллетень за март-май 2014 г.

specifying which projects were being put on hold. Despite this, both U.S. and Russian officials have been generally upbeat in their assessment of their countries' cooperation in the sphere of nuclear security. Director of the Russian Foreign Ministry's security and disarmament department, Mikhail Ulyanov said on May 6th that differences over Ukraine have not impacted cooperation between Russia and the United States in the sphere of nonproliferation.

U.S. Undersecretary of State Rose Gottemoeller believes it is in the best interests of the United States to continue doing nuclear security work in Russia, and any prohibition on the DOE's cooperation with Russian organizations in this sphere would be tantamount to shooting "ourselves in the foot," GSN [reported](#) on May 12th.

In a statement of administration policy released on May 19th and [disclosed](#) by GSN, the White House said it "strongly objects" to bill language that would prevent the Energy Department from continuing to conduct nuclear security work in Russia until the Ukraine crisis and concerns about potential Russian violations of various arms control treaties are resolved.



Kirienko Harrington Ulyanov Gottemoeller

"Dirty Bomb" Material Intercepted in Ukraine

Ukraine's interim government announced on May 5th that a group of individuals had been detained in the Chernivtsi region for allegedly attempting to smuggle possible "dirty bomb" material. GSN [noted](#) that the Ukrainian security services characterized the seized material as a "source of ionizing radiation which possibly contained uranium-235" with a weight of roughly 1.5 kilograms. In a separate development, NATO experts visited Ukraine in May to advise authorities there on improving the safety of nuclear power plants, Reuters [reported](#). In late March, Andriy Deshchytsia, Ukraine's acting foreign affairs minister, said his country might seek foreign help to guard its atomic facilities "if the situation aggravates."

Nuclear Smugglers Sentenced in Kazakhstan

A regional court in the Central Asian republic of Kazakhstan has sentenced four members of a nuclear-smuggling ring to several years in prison for attempting to sell cesium. Among them was an engineer from a Kazakhstani uranium-enrichment facility. He pilfered the cesium-137 from a storage facility in the early 1990s and for years kept the material hidden at his workplace before deciding to ask three local residents in June 2013 to help him sell it, according to an April 27th [report](#) by GSN.

Frank G. Klotz Sworn in as New Head of the NNSA

U.S. Secretary of Energy Ernest Moniz swore in Frank G. Klotz as the Department of Energy's Undersecretary for Nuclear Security and NNSA Administrator on April 22nd 2014. Lt. General (retired) Klotz [said](#), "The United States is committed to maintaining a safe, secure and effective nuclear arsenal, as long as nuclear weapons exist. Our nation is also committed to leading international efforts to limit and reduce nuclear arsenals, prevent nuclear proliferation and nuclear terrorism, and secure nuclear materials across the globe." Klotz served as



U.S.-Russia Initiative to Prevent Nuclear Terrorism

Российско-Американская инициатива по предотвращению ядерного терроризма

March-May 2014 Newsletter Информационный бюллетень за март-май 2014 г.

commander of the U.S. Air Force Global Strike Command before retiring from the military service.

State Department Noted Improvement in CT Cooperation with Russia in 2013

In April, the U.S. State Department [released](#) its Country Reports on Terrorism 2013. The report's section on Russia noted U.S.-Russian counter-terrorism cooperation "showed some improvements in 2013." Specifically, there was an increase in both the frequency and the substance of information exchanges between the FSB and the FBI. In addition, the Counterterrorism Working Group of the Bilateral Presidential Commission made progress on transportation security issues and law enforcement matters.

Russia's Most Wanted Terrorist Is Dead

Russia's Federal Security Service [confirmed](#) on April 8th that Doku Umarov, Russia's most wanted terrorist, is dead. The FSB said Umarov had been killed during a special operation in the first quarter of this year.

Simon Saradzhyan, Belfer Center fellow and IPNT participant, commented that Umarov's death must have been a [tangible setback](#) for the terrorist networks based in the North Caucasus.

Umarov was the founding emir of the Emirate Caucasus, which serves as the umbrella organization for many Islamist militant and terrorist groups operating in the North Caucasus.

U.S. and Russia Set Differences Aside at Nuclear Security Summit

The U.S. and Russia set aside their differences over Crimea to endorse the final statement of the March 24th-25th [Nuclear Security Summit](#) in The Hague that called for enhancing nuclear security.

The [communiqué](#) reaffirmed "the fundamental responsibility of States.... to maintain at all times effective security of all nuclear and other radioactive materials, including nuclear materials used in nuclear weapons, and nuclear facilities under their control. This responsibility includes taking appropriate measures to prevent non-state actors from obtaining such materials – or related sensitive information or technology – which could be used for malicious purposes, and to prevent acts of terrorism and sabotage."

But while they signed the final communiqué, Russia, China and 16 other countries shunned a separate initiative of the U.S., the Netherlands and South Korea at the summit to incorporate the UN nuclear agency's security guidelines into national rules, *The Moscow Times* [reported](#).

Belfer Center Offers Policy Recommendations for Nuclear Security Summit

Belfer Center's [Graham Allison](#), [Gary Samore](#), [William Tobey](#), and [Matthew Bunn](#), who all participate in IPNT, have presented analysis and policy recommendations for the Nuclear Security Summit in the Hague. Samore, Tobey and Bunn have also participated in the [Nuclear Knowledge Summit](#) that preceded the March 24th-25 gathering of world leaders.

Professor Allison called for the establishment of a counterterrorism counterpart of the UN's long-established nuclear-weapons-free zones. Regions that are free of nuclear-weapons material, and commit themselves to remain so, should be recognized as [nuclear-weapons-material-free zones](#), according to Allison who has been [named](#) to the 2014 class of members of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

In his op-ed for the European Leadership Network, [Tobey](#) alerted the summit participants to "the hard truth of our experience over the past several years: despite a lot of good work, we are failing

U.S.-Russia Initiative to Prevent Nuclear Terrorism

Российско-Американская инициатива по предотвращению ядерного терроризма

March-May 2014 Newsletter Информационный бюллетень за март-май 2014 г.

at nuclear security.” The IPNT director has also outlined [detailed recommendations](#) for the world leaders on how they could fix that failure and plan for success at nuclear security summits in 2014 and 2016. The Belfer Center has translated this Stanley Foundation [policy brief](#) – that contains these recommendations – into Russian and attached it to this newsletter.

In the lead-up to the summit, Belfer Center’s Project on Managing the Atom published a report, co-authored by William Tobey, Matthew Bunn, Martin Malin and Nickolas Roth, entitled “[Advancing Nuclear Security: Evaluating Progress and Setting New Goals](#).” The report warned that some weapons-usable nuclear materials in the world still remain “dangerously vulnerable,” with security systems that did not provide effective protection against the full spectrum of plausible adversary threats. The authors highlighted the continuing danger of nuclear and radiological terrorism and called for urgent actions to reduce these risks.

Belfer Center has also continued to maintain and update a [web site](#) dedicated to nuclear security before, during and after the summit.



Samore

Tobey

Malin

Roth

Elbe Group Calls for Continuation of Joint Actions on Preventing Nuclear Terrorism

The [Elbe Group](#) of U.S. and Russian retired military and intelligence leaders met on March 19th-22nd in Morocco. Although the group’s agenda was about issues like nuclear terrorism and Islamic extremism, the crisis in Ukraine and Crimea hung over every discussion, according to the group’s co-organizer Brigadier General [Kevin Ryan](#) (U.S. Army retired), who directs the Defense and Intelligence Projects at the Belfer Center and participates in the IPNT.

At the meeting, U.S. and Russian Elbe members expressed concerns that the situation in Ukraine could spiral out of control resulting in deadly riots or civil war. The message that the Elbe Group conveyed in its [Joint Statement](#) was that, while it is understandable that a



general break in relations is unavoidable, this break should be structured in a way that does not indefinitely interrupt joint actions on sensitive problems like preventing nuclear terrorism, eliminating Syrian chemical weapons, or preventing an Iranian nuclear weapons program.

Robots to Defend Russian ICBM Facilities

Russia is planning to deploy mobile security robots in 2014 to protect its strategic missile facilities. The Russian Defense Ministry said the robots will carry out reconnaissance and patrol missions, detect and destroy stationary or moving targets, and provide fire support for security personnel at the guarded facilities, RIA Novosti [reported](#) on March 12th, 2014.

NOTABLE STATEMENTS ON NUCLEAR TERRORISM:

- **NNSA Administrator Frank G. Klotz:** “The threat to national and global security from state or terrorist acquisition of nuclear and radiological materials is far from gone, and our focus now is on addressing the substantial threats that remain.” (NNSA, May 29, 2014).
- **U.S. President Barack Obama:** “For the foreseeable future, the most direct threat to America at home and abroad remains terrorism....We know all too well, after 9/11, just how technology and globalization has put power once reserved for states in the hands of individuals, raising the capacity of terrorists to do harm.” (White House, May 28, 2014).
- **Director of the Russian Foreign Ministry’s Department for Security Affairs and Disarmament Mikhail Ulyanov:** “We advocate further strengthening of the international legal norms regulating the security of nuclear materials with a view to reducing the proliferation threats and preventing terrorists from acquiring WMDs.” (BBC, May 1, 2014).
- **U.S. President Barack Obama:** “Together, we’ve secured nuclear materials from terrorists....From the reduction of nuclear arms to the elimination of Syria’s chemical weapons, we believe the world has benefited when Russia chooses to cooperate on the basis of mutual interests and mutual respect.” (*Washington Post*, March 26, 2014).
- **Russian Foreign Minister Sergey Lavrov:** “We are concerned about the unjustified accumulation of weapons-grade fissile materials in some countries, which have no nuclear weapons....We are also for the attachment of a universal nature to the fundamental international and legal documents in the PNS area....Nuclear terrorism is still one of the most important threats to international security. Therefore, we attach special attention to raising the level of security of information about the system of protection of nuclear materials and their respective objects.” (Russian Foreign Ministry, March 24, 2014).

UPCOMING EVENTS:

- September 4-5, 2014. NATO summit in Newport, Wales, UK.
- November 15-16, 2014. G-20 Summit in Brisbane, Australia.
- December 5, 2014. 20th anniversary of START I Treaty’s entry into force.
- April 2015. 20th anniversary of Kazakhstan completing shipment of all the nuclear warheads to Russia.
- 2015. NPT Review Conference at the United Nations Headquarters in New York, USA.

U.S.-Russia Initiative to Prevent Nuclear Terrorism
Российско-Американская инициатива по предотвращению ядерного терроризма

March-May 2014 Newsletter Информационный бюллетень за март-май 2014 г.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

The U.S.-Russia Initiative to Prevent Nuclear Terrorism (IPNT) solicits papers, articles and commentary from readers for inclusion in the newsletter and publication on the Initiative's web site. Contact Belfer Center fellow Simon Saradzhyan at (phone) +1-617-496-8228, (fax) +1-617-495-8963, or simon_saradzhyan@hks.harvard.edu.

PHOTO CREDITS:

Photo of Hecker by Stanford; photo of Ulyanov by Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, photos of Allison, Bunn, Elbe Group, Malin, Roth, Samore and Saradzhyan by Belfer Center; photo of Zolotarev by ISKRAN; photo of Arbatov by IMEMO; photos of Klotz and Harrington by NNSA; photo of Kirienko by World Economic Forum; photo of Gottemoeller by U.S. Department of State.

The Working Group of the U.S.-Russia Initiative to Prevent Nuclear Terrorism includes the following institutions:

В рабочей группе по осуществлению Американо-Российской инициативы по предотвращению ядерного терроризма состоят следующие организации:

- ***Belfer Center for Science and International Affairs, John F. Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University [W. Tobey, william_tobey@hks.harvard.edu, 1- 617-496-0518]***

- ***Белферовский центр науки и международных отношений Института государственного управления имени Джона Ф. Кеннеди Гарвардского университета. [Уильям Тоби, william_tobey@hks.harvard.edu, 1- 617-496-0518]***

- ***Center for International Security, Institute for World Economy and International Relations, Russian Academy of Sciences [imemoran@imemo.ru, 7-499-120-52-36]***

- ***Центр международной безопасности, Институт мировой экономики и международных отношений, Российская академия наук [imemoran@imemo.ru, 7-499-120-52-36]***

- ***Center for International Security and Cooperation, Freeman Spogli Institute for International Studies, Stanford University [Dr. S. Hecker, shecker@stanford.edu, 1-650-725-6468]***

- ***Центр международной безопасности и сотрудничества Института международных дел имени Фримана Сподли Стэнфордского университета [Доктор наук З. Хэкер, shecker@stanford.edu, 1-650-725-6468]***

- ***Institute for the U.S. and Canadian Studies, Russian Academy of Sciences [Dr. S. Rogov, pa.to.rogov@rambler.ru, 7-495-691-11-66]***

- ***Институт США и Канады, Российская академия наук [Доктор наук С. Рогов, pa.to.rogov@rambler.ru, 7-495-691-11-66]***